

Tropical Kingbird (1)

2019-128

Date: 12 June 2019

Location: Squire's Point, *Norfolk*

Coordinates: 42.5614257, -80.2503204

Documentation:

12 June 2019

Aidan Place and Hannah Stockford

report, photos (8)

Notes:

- Exact location was Squire's Ridge, Long Point.

Status: Not Accepted (second round)

Round One: Recirculate (4-3-0)

Round Two: Not Accepted (0-7-0)

Tropical Kingbird (1)

2019-128

Round One: Recirculate (4-3-0)

Member	Num/age/sex	Vote	Voting date	Comments
A. Guercio	1/?/?/?	N-ID		Accept as Tropical/Couch's. Figure 3 could be drawn with the line at a slight different angle that would "make" it a Couch's, and the bird's wing is hyperextended in the photo. Wing formula should only really be used on birds in the hand.
B. Mann	1/definitive/alternate/?	Y	02 March 2020	Good analysis
B. Charlton	1/?/?/?	N-ID	22 March 2020	Willing to accept Couch's/Tropical Kingbird. Will be happy to discuss further if others disagree.
D. Sutherland	1/?/?/?	Y	2020-03-05	Tentatively accept. Based largely on the deeply forked tail and bill dimensions, my feeling is that this is a Tropical Kingbird, rather than Couch's. I downloaded some of the images and tried to enhance them in an unsuccessful attempt to see other feather characters. In the absence of vocalizations the committee may feel that it can be accepted only as Couch's /Tropical Kingbird. It may be worth circulating the record to external experts.
K. Burrell	1/first/basic/?	Y	06 March 2020	Excellent report and supporting photos. I am a bit curious to hear what others think about the P10 - P5 figure and their interpretation.
R. Martin	1/?/?/?	N-ID		certainly Couch's/Tropical. First of all, the probability difference here is really not enough to make much out of it. The relative numbers seem somewhat comparable to that of GLIB and WFIB in Ontario, and I would never use that as anything more than a very minor point in ID. In general, when primaries are not arranged mostly in parallel, I'm not convinced we can say anything intelligent about comparative lengths (which I think the report author agrees with) The bill size seems unconvincing to me, as does the head shape. The tail forking feels like the most significant feature here, but it still seems a little sketchy to me. I guess ultimately though these ID features seem to me to be quite new and possibly not sufficiently well tested in the field. If the best birders in e.g. South Texas are regularly ID'ing using these features I'd feel better about it, but I'm not sure they are. Maybe I'm wrong there.
W. Lamond	1/?/?/?	Y	10 March 2020	Prepared to accept the detailed diagnosis of this record by Aidan Place that it is a Tropical and not a Couch's

Tropical Kingbird (1) 2019-128

Round Two: Not Accepted (0-7-0)

Member	Num/age/sex	Vote	Voting date	Comments
A. Guercio	1/?/?/?	N-ID		Accept as Tropical/Couch's. Figure 3 could be drawn with the line at a slight different angle that would "make" it a Couch's, and the bird's wing is hyperextended in the photo. Wing formula should only really be used on birds in the hand.
B. Mann	1/?/?/?	N-ID	28 March 2020	I think there is good analysis by observer pointing towards Tropical. It is the most likely species. However, based on other member's comments about feather detail, we may not be able to 100% decide. Probably best to record as Tropical/Couch's.
B. Charlton	1/?/?/?	N-ID	31 March 2020	Willing to accept Couch's/Tropical Kingbird.
D. Sutherland	1/?/?/?	N-ID	2020-03-30	Accept only as Couch's /Tropical Kingbird. This is probably the safest course of action for this record.
K. Burrell	1/first/basic/?	N-ID	31 March 2020	I think Amanda makes a great point about the wing formula be used only in the hands. Vote yes to 'Tropical/Couch's' Kingbird.
R. Martin	1/?/?/?	N-ID		
W. Lamond	1/?/?/?	N-ID	02 April 2020	I guess I am willing to change to Couch's/Tropical if other members feel that points that the observer uses to distinguish are not really sufficient.